



**UNIVERSITÀ  
DEGLI STUDI  
DI UDINE**  
hic sunt futura

[www.uniud.it](http://www.uniud.it)

# ***First OTM-R Checklist (October-December 2021)***



HR EXCELLENCE IN RESEARCH

### TEMPLATE 3 – OTM-R Checklist

Case number: [2021IT602103](#)

Name Organisation under review: University of Udine

Organisation's contact details: Silvia Bolognini, *Rector's representative for the implementation of the European Charter for Researchers and the Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers* - [cartaue.ricercatori@uniud.it](mailto:cartaue.ricercatori@uniud.it)

SUBMISSION DATE: This checklist was filled in at the end of 2021 by the *Working Group for the European Charter for Researchers and the Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers* (hereinafter "*Charter & Code*" Working Group), chaired by the *Rector's representative for the implementation of the European Charter for Researchers and the Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers*, and was discussed at the meeting of the "*Charter & Code*" Working Group on 13 January 2022. Subsequently, at the request of the *Rector's representative for the implementation of the European Charter for Researchers and the Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers*, the University of Udine has formally adopted (and published in its website) the "Policy for an Open, Transparent and Merit-based Recruitment of Researchers – Summary Document". As a result, an updated version of the OTM-R checklist has been submitted to *EURAXESS* and published in the University website.

DATE ENDORSEMENT CHARTER AND CODE: 20 May 2016

#### **OTM-R Checklist**

A specific self-assessment checklist is provided for Open, Transparent and Merit-Based Recruitment (OTM-R). Please report on the status of achievement and provide details on the indicators and the form of measurement adopted.



***OTM-R checklist for organisations***

	<b>Open</b>	<b>Trans- parent</b>	<b>Merit- based</b>	<b>Answer: ++ Yes, completely +/- Yes, substantially -/+ Yes, partially -- No</b>	<b>*Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)</b>
<b>OTM-R system</b>					
1. Have we published a version of our OTM-R policy online (in the national language and in English)?	X	x	x	<b>NO</b>	The University of Udine has adopted over the years a substantial number of regulations and procedures aimed at creating an OTM-R System, mainly on the basis of the current national legislation. Such regulations and procedures are inspired by the principles and values set out by the <i>European Charter for Researchers</i> and the <i>Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers</i> , as demonstrated by the specific references to these programmatic documents in the regulations adopted following the 2016 "HR Excellence in Research" award. Internal regulations ensure that, as a rule, the procedures for the recruitment and career progression of all categories of researchers are open, transparent and merit-based. Unfortunately, the University of Udine does not have at the moment a summary document which formalizes the principles and procedures inspiring its OTM-R System. For this reason, the <i>Rector's</i>





					<p><i>representative for the implementation of the European Charter for Researchers and the Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers, in agreement with the "Charter &amp; Code" Working Group, will encourage the University of Udine to adopt a Summary Document relating to its OTM-R Policy and to publish it (in Italian and in English) in its website.</i></p>
<p>2. Do we have an internal guide setting out clear OTM-R procedures and practices for all types of positions?</p>	x	x	x	<p><i>Yes, substantially</i></p>	<p>At the University of Udine the recruitment of all categories of researchers is currently governed by internal regulations and complies with the obligations established by the relevant national legislation. Internal regulations ensure that, as a rule, the procedures for the recruitment and career progression of researchers are open, transparent and merit-based. In accordance with the relevant national legislation, some exceptions are provided for, duly motivated and adequate to ensure procedure transparency and the performance of merit-based choices. The competent administrative offices provide the selection Committees with clear instructions for the performance of the selection procedures (relevant legislation, forms, document explaining the procedural steps, etc.), as well as with continuous advice throughout the entire procedure.</p> <p>All relevant internal regulations are published in the University website in Italian, only a part of them being currently available in English.</p>





					<p>The "Charter &amp; Code" Working Group strongly recommends that the University of Udine:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- fill such gap by translating and publishing in English all the internal regulations relating to the procedures for the recruitment and career progression of researchers;</li> <li>- create and make available to researchers, administrative staff and potential candidates a tutorial (in Italian and in English) aimed at illustrating the most important features of the various steps in the procedures for the recruitment and career progression of researchers;</li> <li>- issue specific Guidelines (in Italian and English) aimed at clarifying for each step of the academic career the following details: requirements to be met with in order to apply for a position; sources where competition notices are published; knowledge and skills required for a specific position; and sources providing the relevant rules on the specific selection procedure. Although such information is already available in the University website, its usability may be improved.</li> </ul>
3. Is everyone involved in the process sufficiently trained in the area of OTM-R?	X	x	x	<i>Yes, substantially</i>	<p>The administrative staff of the offices in charge of assisting the selection Committees during the selection procedures are properly trained and regularly updated on legal, technical and IT matters. Such training is carried out by means of meetings and/or training courses organized by the University of Udine, the Ministry of</p>





					<p>University and Research and external companies which the administrative staff are required to attend.</p> <p>The selection Committees are provided by the competent administrative offices with clear instructions for the performance of the selection procedures (relevant legislation, forms, document explaining the procedural steps, etc.), as well as with continuous advice throughout the entire procedure.</p> <p>The Working Group "Charter &amp; Code" strongly recommends that the University of Udine:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- create and make available to researchers, administrative staff and potential candidates a tutorial (in Italian and in English) aimed at illustrating the most important features of the various steps in the procedures for the recruitment and career progression of researchers;</li> <li>- clarify what an OTM-R System is by issuing an outline document that could be entitled "OTM-R in a nutshell";</li> <li>- organize specific information meetings aimed at clarifying how the entire academic staff can contribute to its OTM-R system.</li> </ul>
4. Do we make (sufficient) use of e-recruitment tools?	X	x		<i>Yes, completely</i>	<p>The internal regulations regarding the procedures for the recruitment and career progression of researchers allow the use of e-recruitment tools. More specifically, application forms, as well as all the required supporting documents, may also be submitted by</p>





					<p>electronic means. If the application is submitted by electronic means, the candidate is sent an e-mail by the competent administrative office acknowledging receipt of the application. At the same time, in the exceptional event that dates and methods of performance need to be changed (which should be adequately justified), all candidates are duly and timely informed by e-mail.</p> <p>Where necessary, the selection Committees may use electronic means for their collegial work. The internal regulations allow for some selection procedures, based on qualifications or on qualifications and interview, to be carried out entirely by electronic means.</p>
5. Do we have a quality control system for OTM-R in place?	X	x	x	<i>Yes, substantially</i>	<p>A variety of measures have already been adopted in order to ensure suitable OTM-R quality control. For example, the internal regulations relating to the procedures for the recruitment and career progression of researchers also apply to the appointment and composition of the selection Committees, to the evaluation criteria, to the content of competition notices, etc.</p> <p>The selection Committees are provided by the competent administrative offices with clear instructions for the performance of the selection procedures (relevant legislation, forms, document explaining the procedural steps, etc.), as well as with continuous advice throughout the entire procedure.</p>





					<p>The proceedings of the selection Committee, i.e. the minutes of their meetings, the annexes thereto and the final report, are approved by Rector's Decree.</p> <p>The Rector's Decree approving the proceedings of the selection Committee and the final report are published online in the <i>Albo ufficiale</i> (Official Notice Board) of the University of Udine and in the University website. Candidates can challenge the Rector's Decree approving the proceedings.</p> <p>The "<i>Charter &amp; Code</i>" Working Group strongly recommends that the University of Udine:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- establish a system that simplifies the submission of any complaints (other than challenging the results of the selection procedure), possibly by devoting a special section of its website to such purpose;</li> <li>- set up a system of analysis and self-evaluation that will allow to further verify the degree of application and effectiveness of the OTM-R principles in its procedures for the recruitment and career progression of researchers, for example by assigning to the Evaluation Unit the task of inserting a specific item about it in their annual report.</li> </ul>
6. Does our current OTM-R policy encourage external candidates to apply?	x	x	X	<i>Yes, substantially</i>	The submission of applications is open to all Italian and foreign citizens who meet the requirements established by the competition notices. As a rule, all candidates (both internal





				<p>and external to the University) may submit their application.</p> <p>Competition notices are published in Italian in the University website, more specifically in its online <i>Albo ufficiale</i> (Official Notice Board). If required by the relevant national legislation, competition notices shall also be advertised in the Ministry of University and Research website and in the <i>Official Journal of the Italian Republic</i>.</p> <p>Competition notices are published in English in <i>EURAXESS</i>.</p> <p>Only some competition notices are published in English in the University of Udine website. Access to competition notices in Italian and English (where a translation is already available) is currently allowed through links available in other pages of the University website, first of all the web page dedicated to the <i>European Charter for Researchers</i> and the <i>Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers</i>.</p> <p>The "<i>Charter &amp; Code</i>" Working Group strongly recommends that the University of Udine publish all competition notices in the University website also in English.</p> <p>At the same time, the "<i>Charter &amp; Code</i>" Working Group is aware that the translation of the competition notices in their entirety might be extremely difficult and maybe even excessive. The "<i>Charter &amp; Code</i>" Working</p>
--	--	--	--	---



					<i>Group</i> suggests therefore asking the competent European offices whether a translation of an abstract from the competition notice may be sufficient, the abstract being not too concise and providing all the essential elements to potential candidates.
7. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract researchers from abroad?	x	x	x	<i>Yes, substantially</i>	<p>The submission of applications is open to all foreign citizens who meet the requirements established by the competition notices. Competition notices are published in English in <i>EURAXESS</i>.</p> <p>Only some competition notices are published in English in the University of Udine website. Access to competition notices in Italian and English (where a translation is already available) is currently allowed through links available in different pages of the University website, first of all the web page dedicated to the <i>European Charter for Researchers</i> and the <i>Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers</i>.</p> <p>The "<i>Charter &amp; Code</i>" Working Group strongly recommends that the University of Udine publish all competition notices in the University website also in English.</p> <p>At the same time, the "<i>Charter &amp; Code</i>" Working Group is aware that the translation of the competition notices in their entirety might be extremely difficult and maybe even excessive. The "<i>Charter &amp; Code</i>" Working Group suggests therefore asking the competent</p>



					<p>European offices whether a translation of an abstract from the competition notice may be sufficient, the abstract being not too concise and providing all the essential elements to potential candidates.</p> <p>The "<i>Charter &amp; Code</i>" Working Group points out that the following fact should be taken into account, i.e. remuneration of all categories of researchers is currently regulated by the national legislation, therefore some open positions may be attractive to potential candidates from countries where remuneration is lower but may not be so to those from countries where remuneration is higher.</p>
8. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies aiming at attracting underrepresented groups?	x	x	x	<i>Yes, completely</i>	<p>The Code of Ethics of the University of Udine (published in the University website both in Italian and in English) expressly establishes equal dignity of all members of the academic community and provides that all its members, both in their individual roles and in collegial committees, shall respect and promote equality and human dignity, reject all forms of unfair discrimination and recognize the value of individual and cultural diversity (see, especially, the Preamble of the Code of Ethics).</p> <p>In the procedures for the recruitment and career progression of researchers the University of Udine ensures that all candidates are treated equally and promotes gender equality. To this aim, its <i>Committee for Equal Opportunities, Wellbeing at Work and against Discrimination</i></p>





					<p><i>and Mobbing</i> has adopted a Gender Equality Plan, published in the University website at the page specifically dedicated to the <i>Committee for Equal Opportunities, Wellbeing at Work and against Discrimination and Mobbing</i>.</p> <p>In accordance with the relevant national legislation, no procedures in favour of one specific gender are currently provided for because they might constitute a potential form of discrimination. Anyway, the relevant national legislation provides for tax concessions to researchers returning from abroad and measures to protect researchers on maternity leave (both during the employment relationship and in the evaluation phase) as well as researchers who – due to health issues – could not guarantee a constant level of scientific productivity.</p>
9. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to provide attractive working conditions for researchers?	x	x	x	<i>Yes, completely</i>	<p>The University of Udine ensures attractive working conditions to its researchers both providing them with access to research funds, Campus Libraries, e-resources, resources for open access publishing, training events, etc., and offering them opportunities of career progression.</p> <p>At the same time, the University of Udine urges the Departments to provide researchers with an adequate work desk equipped with laptop and/or desktop PC, as well as a common coffee area.</p> <p>In order to plan the actions necessary to</p>





					<p>achieve improvement, the University of Udine, through its Departments, monitors the perception of wellbeing, safety and quality (also by means of anonymous questionnaires addressed by each single Department to its academic staff).</p> <p>In addition, the University takes into due account the suggestions expressed by the Evaluation Unit in its annual report. Please note that, in accordance with the provisions of the <i>Charter of the University of Udine</i>, the Evaluation Unit is the University body entrusted with the task of evaluating lecturing, research and administrative activities and of verifying, also through comparative cost-return analyses, the correct use of resources, research productivity and lecturing effectiveness, as well as the correct implementation of the principles of impartiality and sound administration.</p> <p>Moreover, the University of Udine relies on the <i>Committee for Equal Opportunities, Wellbeing at Work and against Discrimination and Mobbing</i> which, among other things, performs verification, consultative and proactive tasks aimed at improving employment conditions and the overall quality of the working environment, also through actions against any form of discrimination and moral, physical or psychological violence, as well as encouraging the dissemination of the culture of equal opportunities.</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--





					<p>The "Charter &amp; Code" Working Group strongly recommends that the University of Udine:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– verify that all the Departments ensure equal employment conditions;</li> <li>– verify that all information is available also in English.</li> </ul>
10. Do we have means to monitor whether the most suitable researchers apply?				<i>Yes, completely</i>	<p>In accordance with the relevant national legislation, the internal regulations regarding the procedures for the recruitment and career progression of researchers provide the general evaluation criteria to be followed by the selection Committees.</p> <p>Such criteria take into due consideration, on the one hand, the knowledge and the overall experience of the candidates and, on the other hand, their growth potential. Depending on the type of selection procedure, the importance given to different profiles may vary; notably, the selection procedures for the recruitment of young researchers pay particular attention to growth potential.</p> <p>The internal regulations expressly require that the selected candidate should be the most qualified to perform the functions for which the open position was advertised. They also establish that the evaluation criteria set forth in the competition notice, which should be the basis of the evaluation, should comply with national and international standards, as well as with any additional scientific and lecturing qualifications that may be considered essential.</p>



Advertising and application phase					
11. Do we have clear guidelines or templates (e.g., EURAXESS) for advertising positions?	x	x		<i>Yes, substantially</i>	<p>Open positions are advertised in the University website at the page dedicated to the <i>European Charter for Researchers</i> and the <i>Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers</i>. In order to enable potential candidates to easily find information on open positions of interest, job advertisements are divided by type ("Professors and Researchers", "Research Fellows", "PhD") and include direct links to the relevant competition notices.</p> <p>The internal regulations regarding the procedures for the recruitment and career progression of researchers provide for the advertising of competition notices in the University website, more specifically in its online <i>Albo ufficiale</i> (Official Notice Board). If required by the relevant national legislation, competition notices shall also be advertised in the websites of the Ministry of University and Research and of the European Union, as well as in the <i>Official Journal of the Italian Republic</i>.</p> <p>Competition notices are published in Italian in the University website, more specifically in its online <i>Albo ufficiale</i> (Official Notice Board). If required by the relevant national legislation, competition notices shall also be advertised in the Ministry of University and Research website and in the <i>Official Journal of the Italian Republic</i>.</p>





					<p>Competition notices are published in English in <i>EURAXESS</i>.</p> <p>Only some competition notices are published in English in the University of Udine website.</p> <p>On the other hand, access to competition notices in Italian and English (where a translation is already available) is currently allowed through links available in other pages of the University website, first of all the web page dedicated to the <i>European Charter for Researchers</i> and the <i>Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers</i>.</p> <p>The "<i>Charter &amp; Code</i>" Working Group strongly recommends that the University of Udine publish all competition notices in the University website also in English.</p> <p>At the same time, the "<i>Charter &amp; Code</i>" Working Group is aware that the translation of the competition notices in their entirety might be extremely difficult and maybe even excessive. The "<i>Charter &amp; Code</i>" Working Group suggests therefore asking the competent European offices whether a translation of an abstract from the competition notice may be sufficient, the abstract being not too concise and providing all the essential elements to potential candidates.</p>
12. Do we include in the job advertisement references/links to all the elements foreseen in the relevant section of the toolkit?	x	x		<i>Yes, completely</i>	Competition notices contain all the information relevant for potential candidates. Information on professional development opportunities and career development prospects, as a rule, are





					<p>not included in the competition notices because the national legislation requires a public competition for the recruitment of all categories of researchers in public Universities. Therefore, such issues are normally discussed by the supervisors with their younger researchers. Anyway, in order to help researchers who do not have a supervisor or who have an elusive supervisor, the "Charter &amp; Code Working Group strongly recommends that the University of Udine issue specific Guidelines (in Italian and English) aimed at clarifying for each step of the academic career the following details: requirements to be met with in order to apply for a position; sources where competition notices are published; knowledge and skills required for a specific position; and sources providing the relevant rules on the specific selection procedure. Although such information is already available in the University website, its usability may be improved.</p>
13. Do we make full use of EURAXESS to ensure our research vacancies reach a wider audience?	x	x		<i>Yes, completely</i>	In accordance with the relevant national legislation, competition notices are published in <i>EURAXESS</i> .
14. Do we make use of other job advertising tools?	x	x		<i>Yes, substantially</i>	In accordance with the relevant national legislation, the internal regulations regarding the procedures for the recruitment and career progression of researchers provide for the advertising of competition notices in the University website, more specifically in its online <i>Albo ufficiale</i> (Official Notice Board). If



					required by the relevant national legislation, competition notices are also advertised in the websites of the Ministry of University and Research and of the European Union, as well as in the <i>Official Journal of the Italian Republic</i> . Open positions are also advertised in the University website at the page dedicated to the <i>European Charter for Researchers</i> and the <i>Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers</i> . In order to enable potential candidates to easily find information on open positions of interest, job advertisements are divided by type ("Professors and Researchers", "Research Fellows", "PhD") and include direct links to the relevant competition notices.
15. Do we keep the administrative burden to a minimum for the candidate?	x			<i>Yes, completely</i>	The documentation requested from the candidates is strictly limited to what is actually necessary for a fair, transparent and merit-based selection. In accordance with the relevant national legislation, the University of Udine allows candidates to use self-certification for a large part of the required documentation. Application forms, as well as all the required supporting documents, may also be submitted by electronic means.
<b>Selection and evaluation phase</b>					
16. Do we have clear rules governing the appointment of selection committees?		x	x	<i>Yes, completely</i>	In accordance with the relevant national legislation, the internal regulations relating to the procedures for the recruitment and career





					<p>progression of researchers also apply to the appointment of the selection Committees. A selection Committee is established for all profiles of researchers.</p>
17. Do we have clear rules concerning the composition of selection committees?		x	x	<i>Yes, completely</i>	<p>In accordance with the relevant national legislation, the internal regulations relating to the procedures for the recruitment and career progression of researchers establish clear rules concerning the composition of the selection Committees.</p> <p>More specifically, in accordance with the relevant national legislation, the requirements to be met by each member of the selection Committees are expressly provided for and described by the internal regulations, which are published in the University website and available to everyone.</p> <p>The criteria for appointing the selection Committees take into account the need to ensure that they have the necessary experience and competence to assess the candidates.</p> <p>The competent administrative offices of the University of Udine verify that each member of the selection Committees meets the requirements, including scientific ones, for adequate experience and competence to assess the candidates.</p> <p>Without prejudice to the possibility for candidates to submit any requests for recusal of the selection Committee on the grounds of incompatibility (family ties and/or conflicts of</p>



					interest) of one or more of its members, as a rule the competent administrative offices also verify, on the basis of the information available to them, that there is no cause for incompatibility between the members of the selection Committee and the candidates. A declaration is also required by each member of the selection Committees certifying that there are no causes for incompatibility (family ties and/or conflicts of interest) between them and the candidates.
18. Are the committees sufficiently gender-balanced?		x	x	<i>Yes, completely</i>	In accordance with internal regulations, the composition of the selection Committees guarantees gender balance, whenever possible.
19. Do we have clear guidelines for selection committees which help to judge 'merit' in a way that leads to the best candidate being selected?			x	<i>Yes, completely</i>	In accordance with the relevant national legislation, the internal regulations regarding the procedures for the recruitment and career progression of researchers provide the general evaluation criteria to be followed by the selection Committees. Such criteria take into due consideration, on the one hand, the knowledge and the overall experience of the candidates and, on the other hand, their growth potential. Depending on the type of selection procedure, the importance given to different profiles may vary; notably, the selection procedures for the recruitment of young researchers pay particular attention to growth potential. The internal regulations of the University of Udine expressly require that the selected



					candidate should be the most qualified to perform the functions for which the open position was advertised. They also establish that the evaluation criteria set forth in the competition notice, which should be the basis of the evaluation, should comply with national and international standards, as well as with any additional scientific and lecturing qualifications that may be considered essential.
<b>Appointment phase</b>					
20. Do we inform all applicants at the end of the selection process?		x		<i>Yes, substantially</i>	<p>In accordance with the relevant national legislation, the internal regulations regarding the procedures for the recruitment and career progression of researchers require that the proceedings of the selection Committee, i.e. the minutes of their meetings, the annexes thereto and the final report, shall be approved by Rector's Decree, as a rule, within thirty days from their delivery to the competent administrative offices.</p> <p>The Rector's Decree approving the proceedings of the selection Committee and the final report are published online in the <i>Albo ufficiale</i> (Official Notice Board) of the University of Udine and in the University website. As provided for by the competition notices, the publication of the Rector's Decree approving the proceedings of the selection Committee and the final report counts as notification to all intents and purposes.</p>



21. Do we provide adequate feedback to interviewees?		x		<i>Yes, completely</i>	<p>In accordance with internal regulations, the minutes of the meetings of the selection Committees should include information about the qualifications and publications (where required) that have been assessed, the evaluation criteria adopted, the grades and/or evaluation comments received by each single candidate and the results of the selection. More specifically, the evaluation comment received by each single candidate (where required) should also provide an appropriate description of their strengths and weaknesses. In the event that the final report discloses the results of the selection, but not the grades and/or evaluation comments received by each single candidate (where required), candidates may ask the competent offices to view their own grade and/or evaluation comment, as well as exercise their right of access to the files and view all the documentation relating to the procedure, including the grades and/or evaluation comments received by the other candidates.</p>
22. Do we have an appropriate complaints mechanism in place?		x		<i>Yes, substantially</i>	<p>Candidates can challenge the Rector's Decree approving the proceedings. In accordance with the relevant national legislation, the time limits for any claims and appeals shall run from the date of publication of the Rector's Decree approving the proceedings of the selection Committee. The procedures and time limits for challenging the Rector's Decree approving the</p>



					<p>proceedings of the selection Committee are described in the competition notice.</p> <p>The "<i>Charter &amp; Code</i>" Working Group strongly recommends that the University of Udine establish a system that simplifies the submission of any complaints (other than challenging the results of the selection procedure), possibly by devoting a special section of its website to such purpose.</p>
<b>Overall assessment</b>					
23. Do we have a system in place to assess whether OTM-R delivers on its objectives?				<i>Yes, substantially</i>	<p>The proceedings of the selection Committee, i.e. the minutes of their meetings, the annexes thereto and the final report, are approved by Rector's Decree, as a rule, within thirty days from their delivery to the competent administrative offices.</p> <p>The "<i>Charter &amp; Code</i>" Working Group strongly recommends that the University of Udine set up a system of analysis and self-evaluation that will allow to further verify the degree of application and effectiveness of the OTM-R principles in its procedures for the recruitment and career progression of researchers, for example by assigning to the Evaluation Unit the task of inserting a specific item about it in their annual report.</p>

